RCSI

Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland
e-publications@RCSI

Library Articles

Library

1-1-2001

Irish Medical Historiography

Mary O'Doherty
Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland

Citation
O'Doherty M. Irish Medical Historiography. Irish Journal of Medical Science 2001;170(4):256-60.

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Library at e-publications@RCSI. It has been accepted for inclusion in Library Articles by an authorized administrator of e-publications@RCSI. For more information, please contact epubs@rcsi.ie.

RCSI

— Use Licence —

Attribution-Non-Commercial-ShareAlike 1.0
You are free:
• to copy, distribute, display, and perform the work.
• to make derivative works.
Under the following conditions:
• Attribution — You must give the original author credit.
• Non-Commercial — You may not use this work for commercial purposes.
• Share Alike — If you alter, transform, or build upon this work, you may distribute the resulting work only under a licence identical to this one.
For any reuse or distribution, you must make clear to others the licence terms of this work. Any of these conditions can be waived if you get permission from the author.
Your fair use and other rights are in no way affected by the above.

This work is licenced under the Creative Commons Attribution-Non-Commercial-ShareAlike License. To view a copy of this licence, visit:
URL (human-readable summary):
• http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/1.0/
URL (legal code):
• http://creativecommons.org/worldwide/uk/translated-license

This article is available at e-publications@RCSI: http://epubs.rcsi.ie/libraryart/3

Irish Medical Historiography

Mary O'Doherty

Irish medicine has been fortunate in its historiographers past and present: Wilde, Cameron, Kirkpatrick, Doolin, Widdess, Fleetwood, Lyons and Coakley. Each has provided a number of illustrious and elegantly written works.

William Wilde

Looking back on the great influence of William Wilde, its new editor, on *The Dublin Quarterly Journal of Medical Science*, Kirkpatrick spoke of "Wilde's masterly preface, extending to forty-eight pages, in which he reviewed the history of the *Journal* up to that time [1846], and also gave an admirable summary of the history of Irish medicine and the Irish medical societies".[1] Kirkpatrick added that "Wilde had access to materials which have since been lost, and to his articles we are indebted for much valuable information on Irish medical history of which no other source is now [1932] available"[2] — a reminder that the historian not only interprets the past but, more prosaically, records it also.

Wilde may be considered the first of the Irish medical historiographers. In his writings he surveyed previous historical works, but also gave accounts of contemporary developments in Irish medicine, as, for example, in his introduction to the 1851 census.[3] It was a feature of nineteenth century Irish medical historiography to start with a survey of notable works on Irish medicine down the centuries, including mythological events referred to in the ancient manuscripts. Cameron and Kirkpatrick begin their respective histories of the Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland, and, of Trinity College School of Physic with such a survey. *What's Past is Prologue* (eds. W. Doolin and O. Fitzgerald, 1952)[4] explores aspects of Irish medical history during the middle ages, and has an unique style among books on Irish medical history.

---

[1][Wilde W]. The Editor's Preface. *Dub Qtly J Med Sci.* 1846;1: i-xlviii.

[2]Kirkpatrick TPC. The Dublin Medical Journals. *Ir J Med Sci.* 1932;243-260. 255

[3][Wilde W]. The census of Ireland for the year 1851. Thom, Dublin 1854

[4]Doolin W & FitzGerald O. Eds. What's past is prologue: a retrospect of Irish medicine. Monument Press, Dublin 1952

A Sketch of the History of Irish Medicine

The Dublin Medical Press carried a series entitlted *A Sketch of the History of Irish Medicine* by an (unnamed) learned correspondent throughout the year 1849.[5] The author of the sketch divided the history of Irish medicine into four periods: "The first is the fabulous, ending with the arrival of St. Patrick; the second the Celtic, which extends from that event to the English invasion; the third may be called the Anglo-Celtic, from the English invasion to the beginning of the 18th century; and the last, the scientific, which extends from the latter era to the present times."

The editor of *The Dublin Medical Press* revealed the intention behind publishing this series in remarks following the first contribution. "To some the subject may appear unsuited to our columns, but medical men may rely upon it that the possession of more general information on all subjects connected with our profession becomes every day more necessary. We do not want to make the *Medical Press* a medical book of the *boudoir*, or to fashion it to "draw" customers; all we want is to enable physicians and surgeons to give opinions on subjects peculiarly their province."

The writing of medical history by the profession for the profession had been characterised by a doxographical approach to medical historiography until recent decades. Gert Brieger defines and explains this approach in his essay on the historiography of medicine in the *Companion encyclopaedia of the history of medicine* (1993).[6] He outlines how "the history of medicine was long dominated by a simple, positivist point of view. The great doctors and the great ideas were often portrayed as a march of the intellect, devising new explanations of disease and techniques for curing the ills of humankind. . . Physicians have always been eager to learn about the opinions of their predecessors. This was the hallmark of history in the service of medicine."

Fleetwood

Fleetwood, however, in the preface to his first edition of *The History of Medicine in Ireland* in 1951 was not confined by this tradition, but intended the book primarily for the layman.[7] A reviewer added that "it should also be read with great interest and profit by medical practitioners" — as Fleetwood had also hoped. Still the standard reference work, *The History of Medicine in Ireland* (2nd ed. 1983), was

---

[5]A Sketch of the History of Irish Medicine by a learned correspondent. *Dublin Medical Press* 1849.

[6]Brieger GH. The historiography of medicine. In: Companion encyclopaedia of the history of medicine. Bynum WF & Porter R. Eds. Routledge, London 1993; vol 1; 24-44. 24

[7]Fleetwood J. The History of Medicine in Ireland. Brown and Nolan, Dublin 1951, 2nd ed. Skellig Press, Dublin 1983

the first and only comprehensive survey and narrative account of the subject. It was said by Doolin in 1951[8], and echoed thirty years later by Fleetwood himself, that the definitive history of Irish Medicine had yet to be written. The scholar, with the necessary "knowledge of Gaelic, Latin and English, middle and old, as well as of medicine", required to write it, may never now emerge. At this description the spectre of John Knott ("the Forgotten Scholar") hovers! [9]

Cameron, Kirkpatrick and Widdess

The great value of Cameron's *History of the Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland* published in 1886 lies in its scope and comprehensiveness.[10] A veritable compendium, its full title, *History of the Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland and of the Irish Schools of Medicine; including numerous biograhical sketches: also a medical bibliography,* shows what a *thesaurus* it is. By its nature this work frequently provides the starting point to explore a topic.

Kirkpatrick's peculiar *genius* as bibliophile, archivist, historian and physician, probably makes him the single individual who did most to salvage and integrate the ephemeral material upon which Irish medical history is based. He gathered, recorded and safeguarded, whether in snippets or tomes, information about obscure individuals as well as leading institutions.[11] Kirkpatrick brought such a distinctive synthesis to a disparate range of sources, that he is the historian without peer of Irish medicine.[12]

A forté of Widdess, long the doyen of Irish medical history, was for rediscovering things. He brought to light the fifteenth century manuscript, the *practica of John of Arderne*, which had lain *perdu* on the shelves of the RCSI library. He also researched and wrote a definitive study of the eighteenth century *Collectanea Hibernica Medica,* thus saving from obscurity what he termed an unrecognised medical periodical.

It was Widdess who researched and published accounts of advances as they applied to medical practice in Ireland; the first use of anaesthesia by John M'Donnell, the first blood transfusion by Robert M'Donnell, the development of the endoscope by Francis Cruise, and a host more topics

---

[8]Doolin W. Foreword to The History of Medicine in Ireland by Fleetwood, 1951

[9]Lyons JB. John Freeman Knott, 1853-1921. *Long Room* 1989; 34: 31-46.

[10]Cameron CA History of the Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland, and of the Irish schools of medicine: including numerous biographical sketches, also a medical bibliography. Fannin, Dublin 1886, 2nd ed. 1916

[11]Kirkpatrick TPC. History of the Medical Teaching in Trinity College Dublin and of the School of Physic in Ireland. Hanna & Neale, Dublin 1912; The History of Dr Steevens' Hospital. Dublin University Press, Dublin 1924

[12]O'Doherty M. T. Percy C. Kirkpatrick, physician, bibliophile. *Long Room* 1998; 43: 38-43

not previously documented. Author of histories of the Charitable Infirmary and of the Richmond, Whitworth and Hardwicke Hospitals, Widdess's *magna opera* are the histories of the Royal College of Physicians of Ireland and of the Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland.[13] His flair for assembling and compiling exhibition catalogues still bears fruit.

Doolin

The great contribution of William Doolin (1887-1962) to the historiography of Irish medicine lay in his work as an editor. Following Kane, Graves, Stokes and Wilde he edited the *Irish Journal of Medical Science* from 1925 until his death in 1962. From 1952 he edited also the *Journal of the Irish Medical Association.* To the role of an editor, selecting and preparing for publication the writings of others, Doolin brought, apart from his celebrated literary gifts, qualities of kindness and generosity, that elicited and encouraged the talent of others.

Doolin's own exquisitely written pieces and lectures on the history of medicine inspired many of his younger colleagues. One of them has recalled how "His pre-eminence with words, equally gifted as an orator and a writer, earned international recognition".[14] To read Doolin's essays is to discover, perhaps for the first time, the glory of the essay form. A check-list compiled by JB Lyons of Doolin's publications shows their range and number.[15] The many obituaries and citations he prepared enrich the historical record.

The remarkable influence of Doolin on the Irish medical students who encountered him was recognised by JB Lyons, who writes: "Those of us in the Dublin schools who had stumbled on Osler's *Aequanimitas* and then encountered Bill Doolin, whose clinical teaching at 'Vincent's' was embellished with historical images, had kindled within us an unquenchable taste for the illumination of the present by the past."[16] How apt that Doolin should have addressed a Faculty of Medicine with Henry Ford's question "Is History "Bunk"?" Affirming the role of history in the life of a doctor, Doolin also thereby claims its place in medical education. Waldeyer, the German anatomist, observed to Doolin in 1913:

---

[13]Widdess JDH. An unrecognised medical periodical – *Collectanea Hibernica Medica. Ir J Med Sci.* 1955: 377-9; Robert M'Donnell - a Pioneer of Blood Transfusion. *Ir J Med Sci* 1952: 11-20; The Charitable Infirmary, Jervis Street, Dublin, 1718-1968. Thom, Dublin 1968; The Richmond, Whitworth & Hardwicke Hospitals: St. Laurence's Dublin, 1772-1972. s.n., Dublin [1972]; A History of the Royal College of Physicians of Ireland. Livingstone, Edinburgh 1963; The Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland and its Medical School 1784-1984, 3rd ed., RCSI, Dublin 1984

[14]Lyons, JB. Ed. Dublin's surgeon-anatomists and other essays by William Doolin: a centenary tribute. Department of the history of medicine, RCSI, Dublin 1987. 47

[15]A checklist of William Doolin's publications compiled by JB Lyons. RCSI, Dublin [1980]

[16]Lyons JB. 'Irish medical historiography'. In: O'Brien E. Ed. Essays in honour of J.D.H. Widdess. Dublin 1978. 89-111. 108

"The knowledge of literature — and in that I include history — makes its possessor a wiser man; it is *the* most necessary quality for the doctor in practice". [17]

Commemoration

The historiography of Irish medicine is also characterised by its commemorative nature. Even in this 2000 year review*, commemoration is the driving force. (*Lyons, JB. Ed. 2000 years of Irish medicine. Eireann Healthcare Publications, Dublin 1999) Occasion to celebrate individuals, events and institutions, with the written word, has given rise to much of the corpus of Irish medical history. Inspired, no doubt, not only by Clio, the muse of history, but also by Calliope and Erato, the muses of poetry, John Gilborne was moved "to celebrate the names of the learned and worthy men who practise in our time the several branches of the healing art in our metropolis, and some parts of the country of Ireland where the author has been conversant." In 1775 Gilborne published in Dublin *The Medical Review, a Poem, being a Panegyric on the Faculty of Dublin; Physicians, Surgeons, and Apothecaries, marching in Procession to the Temple of Fame.* [18]

And so, ever since, the lives of our leading medical personages have been well documented e.g. Graves, Stokes, Wilde, Colles.[19] However, in 1951, Fleetwood expressed the view that "all too often the historical aspect of medicine here is dismissed with a reference to Stokes, Graves or one of the few others whose fame is international."[20] Nearly fifty years later this still holds true, with the same few illustrious names being reiterated, rarely regaining much in the telling. This is all the more disappointing when there are topics without number just awaiting their researchers.

Similarly, certain hospitals attracted the attention of historians more than others, such as Swift's St Patrick's, and the Rotunda.[21] The recent closure of a number of hospitals, no longer feasible in twenty-first century economics, has also given rise to the publication of their histories as farewell memoirs.[22] The anniversaries of medical institutions

---

[17]Doolin W. Is history "bunk"? *The Lancet*, ii, 1958, 1364-1366. 1365

[18]Gilborne J. *The Medical Review, a Poem, being a Panegyric on the Faculty of Dublin; Physicians, Surgeons, and Apothecaries, marching in Procession to the Temple of Fame.* Dublin 1775

[19]Coakley D. Robert Graves Evangelist of Clinical Medicine. Irish Endocrine Society, Dublin 1996
Fallon M. Abraham Colles. Heinemann, London 1972

[20] Fleetwood *op. cit.* ix

[21]Browne O'Donel TD. The Rotunda Hospital 1745-1945. Livingstone, Edinburgh 1947
Browne Alan DH. Ed. Masters, Midwives and Ladies in Waiting. A&A Farmar, Dublin 1995.

[22]O'Brien E, Browne L, O'Malley, K. Eds. The House of Industry Hospitals, 1772-1988. Anniversary Press, Dublin 1988
Lyons JB. The Quality of Mercer's. Glendale Press, Dublin 1991
Gatenby PBB. Dublin's Meath Hospital. Town House, Dublin 1996

have also prompted celebratory publications. *A portrait of Irish medicine* (edited by E. O'Brien et al., 1984) for the bicentenary of the Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland is a notable example.[23]

Histories of medicine for the regions of Ireland have emerged, such as those of Cork by Cummins,[24] and of Galway by Murray,[25] thereby reducing the preponderance of works relating to Dublin practitioners and institutions. These various memorials give substance to Osler's observation that "in the continual remembrance of a glorious past individuals and nations find their noblest inspiration."[26]

Current trends in the history of medicine

During the last decade or so, history itself — not to mention historiography — has undergone a process of re-evaluation, and, amid much contention, revision. On the subject of Irish medical historiography, there is, significantly, only one published article, and this, by J.B. Lyons, is, fittingly, in a *festschrift* for Widdess.[27] Historians of Irish medicine have not, so far, been given to the self-scrutiny of present day professional historians, or to the searching analysis of their discipline. History seems ever to suggest something different, reminiscent of Alice's bizarre discovery in Wonderland, that things can "mean whatever one wants them to mean". While the words of Martí-Ibáñez echo strangely: "without history nothing has a full meaning".[28]

Whatever the theory, History nowadays encompasses more. University history departments and their students are now looking to medicine — heretofore *terra incognita* — and discovering a whole new world to explore. Ironically generations of medical students themselves have scarcely had the leisure to become acquainted with the history of the profession they are about to enter. "Medical history", according to Sigerist, "teaches us where we came from, where we stand in medicine at the present time, and in what direction we are marching. It is the compass that guides us into the future".[29] Their inheritance, denied to students of medicine, is being taken up by others.

---

23 O'Brien E. et al. Eds. A portrait of Irish medicine: an illustrated history of medicine in Ireland. Ward River Press, Co. Dublin 1984

24 Cummins NM. Some Chapters of Cork Medical History. Cork University Press 1957

25 Murray JP. Galway: a medico-social history. Kenny's Bookshop, Galway 1994

26 Camac CNB. Ed. Counsels and ideals from the writings of William Osler. 2nd ed. Oxford University Press, London 1921. 24

27 Lyons JB. 'Irish medical historiography'. In: O'Brien E. Ed. Essays in honour of J.D.H. Widdess. Dublin 1978. 89-111.

28 Martí-Ibáñez F. In: Strauss MB. Ed. Familiar medical quotations. Little, Brown and Company, Boston 1968. 215

29 Sigerist HE. In: Strauss *op. cit.* 215

In the realm of history whole sectors of society that scarcely seemed to exist, and, less still, to be worthy of note, are now being recovered: women, nurses and patients. Brieger contends that "in recent years, Roy Porter has been especially articulate in calling for a history of medicine from the patient's perspective. What is different in the present generation is that many of Porter's colleagues have heard and heeded the call."[30] One may, indeed, mention Tony Farmar's *Holles Street: The National Maternity Hospital 1894-1994* as a book in this mood.[31]

Eric Freeman remarks that "the history of nursing was cursed with dull narrative and anecdotal accounts. Recently, there has been something of a minor renaissance in this blighted corner of medical history".[32] The appearance of *The Irish Nurse* by Pauline Scanlan (1991) was most welcome, as the accounts of Irish nursing prior to this were mere scraps.[33]

For Darenberg "The besetting vice, of the histories of medicine, one which afflicts them almost all with sterility, is the circumstance that in these works our discipline is considered as an isolated invention without either relations or consanguinity with the other creations of the human spirit: 'Proles sine matre creata.'" (Offspring created without a mother).[34] The need to provide context when writing historical accounts cannot be over emphasised. "'History in context'", Freeman declares, "is the basis of the social historian's creed." He conceeds that "in the hands of its finest practitioners the social approach to medical history is an illuminating and exciting entry to the medicine of the past".[35] An example of this is to be found in *A Pride of Professors*; (1999) where JB Lyons explores the development of medicine since the early nineteenth century, through the lives and careers of the professors of medicine at the Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland.[36]

According to Brieger "this new, more mature social history of medicine of recent decades has better managed to keep both the individual doctor and the patient as well as their society in proper view."[37] The late FOC Meenan, a fine practitioner in the social history of

---

[30]Brieger GH. *op. cit.* 26

[31]Farmar A. Holles Street 1894-1994: The National Maternity Hospital: A centenary history. A & A Farmar, Dublin 1994

[32]Freeman EJ. Historical, biographical and bibliographical sources. In: Information Sources in the Medical Sciences. Eds. Morton LT & Godbolt S. 4th ed. Bowker-Saur, London 1992; 557-91. 571

[33]Scanlan P. The Irish Nurse: a study of nursing in Ireland: history and education 1718-1981. Drumlin, Manorhamilton 1991

[34]Daremberg C. In: Strauss MB *op. cit.* 214

[35]Freeman EJ. *op. cit.* 558

[36]Lyons JB. A Pride of Professors; the lives of the professors of medicine at the Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland. A & A Farmar, Dublin 1999

[37]Brieger GH. *op. cit.* 26

medicine in Ireland, undertook pioneering studies of Dublin's Georgian squares and their fascinating medical connections.[38] In their memoirs Lombe Athill, Robert Collis, James Deeny and Noel Browne provide insights into their lives and times, and background to their activities.[39]

Another feature of the historiography of Irish medicine is the ever-increasing numbers researching, writing and publishing on a wide range of matters relating to medicine in Ireland in the past. These exponents are from a variety of disciplines and bring different methods to the study. Brieger, tracing this development explains "if anything may be said with certainty about recent trends in scholarship in the humanities and social sciences, and medical history, it is that we are witnessing an increasing amount of interdisciplinary work. The crossing of traditional boundaries that once separated history, literature, sociology, and anthropology is now commonplace in those fields as it is in [the history of medicine]. While in a previous generation the fields ancillary to the history of medicine were philology, palaeography, and epigraphy, now linguistics, anthropology, sociology and demography have taken their place."[40] It is a shock to find that the history of medicine includes the study of early television hospital dramas.

General publishers say medical history is slow to sell. This diminishes their interest in the genre and it is gratifying to find the Institute of Public Administration sponsoring it. Their publications include Joseph Robins' *Fools and Mad*, Joseph Reynold's *Grangegorman. Psychiatric Care in Dublin since 1815* and Ruth Barrington's *Health, Medicine and Politics in Ireland, 1900-70.*[41] The publication in 1999, by Cork University Press, of *Medicine, Disease and the State in Ireland 1650-1940*, marks a watershed in Irish medical historiography. Its editors, Greta Jones and Elizabeth Malcolm, see it as 'providing the first substantial modern history of medicine in Ireland.'[42] The editors and most of the contributors are professional historians, rather than members of the medical profession, and their approach is analytical and contextual. The editors highlight the constant gaps and

---

[38]Meenan FOC. The Georgian Squares of Dublin and their Doctors. *Ir J Med Sci* 1966; 149-154.

[39]Athill L. Recollections of a long professional life, 1844 to 1904. BMA, London 1910
Collis WRF. To Be a Pilgrim. Secker & Warburg, London 1975
Deeny J. To cure and to care: memoirs of a chief medical officer. Glendale Press, Dun Laoghaire 1989
Browne N. Against the Tide. Gill and Macmillan ,Dublin 1986

[40]Brieger *op. cit.* 26

[41]Robins J. *Fools and Mad*: a history of the insane in Ireland. Institute of Public Administration, Dublin 1986
Reynolds J. *Grangegorman. Psychiatric Care in Dublin since 1815.* Institute of Public Administration in association with Eastern Health Board, Dublin 1992
Barrington R. Health Medicine and Politics in Ireland 1900-1970. Institute of Public Administration, Dublin 1987

[42]Malcolm E, Jones G. Eds. Medicine, Disease and the State in Ireland, 1650-1940. Cork University Press 1999 ix

limitations in knowledge they encountered. They suggest that the roles of religion and politics in the development of medicine in Ireland have not been adequately studied. Signposts to new research in a new millennium abound.

The Irish medical journals

The variety of Irish journals of long ancestry is an exciting facet of Irish medical historiography. These very journals are part of the history of Irish medicine, and themselves a potential source of fresh research, with the prospect of new gleanings on any number of hitherto unexplored topics. The *Irish Journal of Medical Science* and the *Medical Press and Circular* are veritable cachets of recorded data, yet to foster new studies and new interpretations. The work of Wilde and Kirkpatrick in compiling indexes to the *Dublin Quarterly Journal of Medical Science* has facilitated its readers, and is another indication of the merit of their activities.[43] Likewise, the accounts by Wilde and Kirkpatrick of the Irish medical journals constitute major contributions to the record of the history of Irish medicine.[44] Study of these journals will yield rewards.

Sources, indexes and bibliographies

The corpus of writing on the history of Irish medicine is vast. Guidance is needed to find one's way within it. There are a few key sources and indexes, and these reveal the extent of the subject, and the dispersal of its publications. Without the benefit of Hayes's *Sources for the History of Irish Civilisation* one would never dream that *The Irish Builder*, for example, could be such a repository for historical material relating to *medicine* (beyond the actual construction of hospital buildings, and, possibly, sanitary science).[45] [46] Scatter is indeed a problem, and one cannot be sure, in the absence of an overall indexing tool, that a search for publications on a given topic is comprehensive.

So far published work in Irish history of medicine receives scant reckoning in the standard bibliographies, by comparison to that of other

---

[43][Wilde, W]. A general index to the Dublin Medical Journal from volume I to XXVIII, concluding the first series, from 1832 to 1845, inclusive. *Dublin J Med Sci* XXVIII 1845 1-127
Kirkpatrick TPC. An index to the biographical notices that have appeared in the Journal since its commencement in March 1832. *Dublin J Med Sci* cxlii 1916. 110-118;
An index to the papers on the history of medicine that have been published in the Dublin Journal of Medical Science from its commencement to August 1916. *Dublin J Med Sci* cxliii 1916. 302-310

[44]Kirkpatrick TPC. An Account of the Irish Medical Periodicals. Falconer, Dublin 1916;
Dublin Medical Journals. *Ir J Med Sci* 1932. 243-260

[45]Hayes, RJ *Index to sources for the history of Irish civilisation; periodical articles.* Boston, Mass. 1940-67

[46]History of Dublin Hospitals and Infirmaries, from 1188 till the present time. *The Irish Builder*; XXXVIII, no. 880-912, Aug 15 – Dec 15, 1896; Jan 1 – Dec 15, 1897

countries. Ireland tends to appear under the heading *Great Britain and Ireland.* In the *Guide to Information Sources in the Medical Sciences*, (4th ed. 1992), in a chapter on historical sources *inter alia*, only two works are cited for Ireland, viz. *Portrait of Irish Medicine* and 'Fleetwood'.[47]

Guardians of the flame

Eric Freeman's words hold a particular charm. "If medicine cannot quite claim to be the oldest profession, it can certainly look back farther than most to an exceptionally well-recorded past, thanks to a long line of dedicated historians, bibliographers and librarians."[48] One might add, "and particularly in Ireland."

[47]Freeman EJ. *op. cit.* 566

[48]Freeman EJ. *op. cit.* 577